



MEETING MINUTES

Restoration Advisory Board (RAB)

For the Former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads

Club Cívico La Seyba, Ceiba, Puerto Rico

Meeting No. 9 - September 9, 2008

Note: These minutes are a summary based on informal notes taken at the meeting. They are not intended as a verbatim transcript and may not have captured everything that was discussed. If comments or additional notes are provided by others who were present at the meeting, within 30 days of distribution of these minutes, those will be added as an attachment to these minutes.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOMING REMARKS

The meeting began at 6:20 p.m. with David Criswell (Navy) welcoming RAB members and visitors. Attachment 1 provides the attendance list. David apologized to the members for the length of time that had passed since the last RAB meeting was held.

II. ACTION ITEMS

David Criswell discussed the status of the following action items, which were carried forward from the April 2008 RAB meeting. Closed action items are shown in the minutes from each RAB meeting, respectively. This table shows ongoing items and those items that were closed at this meeting.

Item	Description	Discussion	Status
#1	Boats beached at the mud flats (near the housing area) after Hurricane Hugo, 20 years ago.	No evidence of spills or contamination from that event. The boats were salvaged and removed.	Complete

1

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Item	Description	Discussion	Status
#2	Update on the Hospital application and benefit to the local community.	Discussed at Local Reuse Authority (LRA) meeting in July. The hospital administrators have still not responded to the issue regarding what benefits will be available to the residents of Ceiba/Naguabo.	Ongoing for LRA, but not for RAB
#3	LRA to meet with RAB members to discuss Portal del Futuro land use.	Meeting was held in July. There are many issues regarding the lack of communication by the LRA and their lack of availability to meet with the community.	LRA will check if there are meeting minutes available
#4	Drone activities that were conducted at Cabras Island.	Mr. Velázquez from base security will provide specific coordinates where the drones may be located.	Ongoing
#5	Information about excavation of historic artifacts on the base.	It was questioned why the artifacts are taken out of Puerto Rico. Navy to research who was involved in the fieldwork (particularly if they were archaeologists from Puerto Rico).	Ongoing (discussed at this meeting)

III. RAB/LRA MEETING – David Criswell

- **Attendees:**
 - Mr. Calimano, Port Authority, Mr. Martin, Servicios de Salud Episcopales, Inc., Mr. Antonio Colorado, Portal del Futuro, Mr. Ramon Figueroa, RAB Community Co-chair, Mr. Jorge Fernández Porto, RAB Member (and advisor to Senator Lourdes Santiago); Mr. David Criswell, RAB Navy Co-chair; Mr. Molzan, Navy Base Closure Manager;
- Presentations by Ramón Figueroa, Jorge Fernández, and Antonio Colorado.
- Responses to questions by Mr. Calimano, Mr. Martin, Mr. Criswell and Mr. Molzan.
- David Criswell provided a summary of the issues that were discussed in the meeting with the LRA.
 - Port Authority is in serious negotiations for contracts to provide jobs for Ceiba residents.
 - Servicios de Salud Episcopales will create more than 200 jobs at the hospital, as well as medical education.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

- LRA updated plans for the Zoning Plan, including protection of the marine/terrestrial boundary.
- LRA reviewed the process that was followed to develop the Reuse Plan for Roosevelt Roads.
- The public expressed their concerns about the manner in which the Reuse Plan was developed.
- The community feels that it has been excluded from the decision-making process in regards to the hospital.

Discussion:

- Lirio Marquez (RAB member) mentioned that she still has a question for the hospital regarding whether there will be some type of preference will be given to the residents of Ceiba, since the transfer was for the municipality. She said that a response is due to the community and should become part of the official record. What benefits will the community have from the transfer?
 - Action Item: Verify whether the LRA meeting was recorded and what the status of the meeting minutes is.
- A community member asked if the jobs that are going to be generated will be temporary or permanent.
- Luis Velázquez (RAB member) mentioned the problem of welding and cancer and that the minutes from the first meetings should be searched to see where the hospital agreed to carry out the studies regarding these conditions.
- Lirio asked the LRA when the Zoning Plan will be available for public comment. The LRA representative said that they have already presented the draft to the Planning Board and to the mayor, and at the end of September or beginning of October the final draft will be presented to the Planning Board, who will then decide or schedule when it will be issued for public comment.
- Lirio asked about the petition that the community made for the Department of Natural Resources to demarcate the marine/terrestrial zone.
- John Henry (RAB member) asked when the airport will be ready – if it will be in October as it says on the sign that was placed at the eastern entrance. Ramón mentioned that he doesn't believe it will be ready by that date.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Status: Sale Parcels I and III - David Criswell

Discussion Points:

- All contaminated sites have been “carved out” of the sale property.
 - Finding of Suitability for Transfer (FOST) is now for clean property only.
 - Only clean property will be transferred to buyer of Sale Parcels I and III.
- All sites ‘carved out’ will be leased to new owner(s) of Sale I and III property.
 - Finding of Suitability to Lease (FOSL) - EPA has approved.
 - Includes restrictions as needed to protect human health and to allow the cleanup to continue.
 - Leased sites will be transferred to new owner(s) after the cleanup is complete.
- Navy will continue cleanup on FOSL property.
- Online auction early in 2009.
- One RAB member mentioned that the survey shows sale parcels including mangroves and water areas as part of the sale even though Puerto Rican law does not allow it.
- Lirio asked who cleans up the parcels from the “carved out” and if the FOSL does not have to be submitted for public comment. It was explained that the information that is contained in the FOSL is extracted from other documents that are found in the Administrative Record.
- Jorge asked: Does the lease include limitations of use? David answered: Yes.
- Tim Gordon (EPA) mentioned that the EPA and EQB review and comment on the FOST and FOSL documents, and if the community would like to see them they can request them.
- Ramón Figueroa (RAB co-chair) requested clarification regarding the evaluation of those documents.
- The community expressed concerns about having to travel to San Juan to review the documents because the LRA does not have an office in Ceiba, and the location where they were going to be set up locally has not been done yet.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Status: Sale Parcel II - Housing - David Criswell

- Finding of Suitability for Transfer (FOST)
 - Reviewed by EPA and Puerto Rico EQB.
 - Will have copies of these documents (FOSL, FOST) uploaded onto web page if not available yet.
 - All property is clean.
- Online auction early in 2009.

Discussion:

- One RAB member mentioned that since the conservation zone was already transferred from the Navy's jurisdiction, fishermen could fish near these areas. The Puerto Rico Conservation Trust (PRCT) representative did say that it was all right to do so. However, after the meeting, Commander Kalal discussed this with the PRCT, pointing out that this was not entirely true since the Navy still owns the small arms range and the public cannot be near that area. They must keep at least 1,500 feet of distance from the shore. These meeting minutes serve as clarification but it must be re-emphasized in the next meeting.

IV. WHAT'S NEW!

Archeological Excavations

- Several sites of cultural significance were found.
- Memorandum of Agreement between Navy and Puerto Rico's State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO).
- Follows Federal Law (48 FR 44 738-9).
 - Four sites require recovery of artifacts, to protect them and to allow historical research.
- David Criswell explained that the artifacts that were taken will be returned to Puerto Rico, and the Navy and Preston (sp) are discussing whether they will be returned to an area in the east, possibly to the University of Puerto Rico.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

- Jorge commented that there are archeologists here in Puerto Rico that are dying of hunger and asked why the Navy contracted people from Florida to excavate and take them away from Puerto Rico to be treated and later returned.
- David explained that this was coordinated with the SHPO and agreed to search for the names of those who are treating these finds o artifacts. The excavations were carried out in the parcels that will be sold.

Search, Inc. of Gainesville, FL conducted the excavations

- Consulting with Puerto Rican historians and the National Park Service.
- Local historians involved are from Puerto Rican universities.

Archeological Excavations

- Artifacts are being housed and studied at Search, Inc.'s facility in Gainesville, FL.
- Artifacts will be returned to Puerto Rico
- Puerto Rico SHPO and DNER will determine the final location of artifacts in the future.
- The LRA Zoning Plan and Commonwealth Law will ensure future protection of unknown archeological sites and artifacts.

Covenant Deferral Request:

- Was signed by Governor for the Maritime Port Parcel.
- Allows the transfer of Port Parcel to Port Authority - including four contamination sites: Tow Way Fuel Farm (SWMU 7/8); TCE Plume (SWMU 55); Fuel Pipelines and Hydrant Pits (SWMU 74); *Building 803 (SWMU 75)*
- Navy will continue cleanup of these sites.
- No impact to cleanup schedules.
- A member of the community asked about the sampling on Cabra Island, when they are going to take away the rockets. David answered that first the historical record must be searched to see what type of rockets there are.

Airfield Transfer

- Transferred to Port Authority in February 2008.
- Navy will continue cleanup of sites.
- Dedicated fixed-price contract to complete all cleanup at Airfield awarded to Right Way Environmental Contractors of Naranjito, Puerto Rico.
- A soil removal action will be carried out.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Additional Cleanup Actions

SWMU 7/8 - Tow Way Fuel Farm

- EPA Approved Statement of Basis – January 2007.
 - *Describes selected cleanup action*
- Remove arsenic-contaminated soil.
- Clean up fuel in groundwater.
- Natural attenuation will continue to be monitored.
- Jorge asked how they will take out the lead with natural attenuation, and Mark Kimes answered that the lead was going to be removed from the soil.
- Jorge asked: and in the groundwater? Mark: The concentrations are below the limits and there will be a land use control for the non-residential area.
- Jorge: But the migration is being taken into account? Mark: Yes, we developed a groundwater model with the direction of the flow towards Ensenada Honda and the results show that it is not moving towards Ensenada Honda and the migration is remaining in the restricted area, not the residential area, and even if it were to reach Ensenada Honda the concentrations would be so low it would not have an impact.
- Jorge: Did you take into consideration the various sources of lead to estimate the concentrations, such as the landfills? Mark: Yes, AOC D covers all of the sediments within Ensenada Honda. Suspected contaminants from sites adjacent to Ensenada Honda were kept with those sites instead of placing them into AOC D.

SWMUs 54 and 55 - TCE Plumes

- Implement pilot scale cleanup actions.
- To inject sodium permanganate.
- Begin monitored natural attenuation.
- Cleanup contract awarded to AGVIQ/CH2M-Hill
- A member of the community asked how they know if the jeuyes and the mangos are not contaminated with metals. Mark: The Navy is carrying out an Ecological Risk Assessment that includes plants, terrestrial animals, and birds.
- Why aren't they taking samples from people who eat the jueyes and mangos? Mark: We don't ignore them; the HHRAs account for human health risks, following EPA guidance.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

- Ramón Figueroa: What is the agency that regulates fishing in Roosevelt Roads? The DNER representative answered that the Fishing Law is administered by the DNER but given the conditions of Roosevelt Roads they do not feel at liberty to implement them in locations that still belong to the Navy. David: They have concurrent jurisdiction with federal and state.
- A fisherman said that sometimes when he is fishing, the Coast Guard, DNER, and Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS) surrounds him, but he doesn't understand what they are telling him to do. The water restrictions cannot be removed until the property is transferred.
- Commentary from a member of the community: I am one of 5 federal policemen that try to prevent looting/vandalism from taking out the buildings. The Bundy area was not maintained and the buildings have been sabotaged and all of the asbestos and other toxic substances were left exposed, and people became sick and as there is no Safety Officer they cannot pay him. He requests that they investigate these areas and there is an answer for the next meeting (Action Item). David said they would verify this.

Cabras Island

Drone Launch Facility

- Drones used during training exercises at former Vieques Naval Training Range.

Owned by US Coast Guard

Environmental Condition of Property study ongoing

- Samples in Drone Launch Area.
- Review Operations history.

Transfer buildings and facilities to US Coast Guard

IV. UPCOMING REMEDIATION ACTIVITIES

Sites at the Airfield - Mark Kimes

Fire training pit area (SWMU 14)

- Surface soil (to 1 foot below ground surface) will be excavated.

Hangar 200 Apron (SWMU 56)

8

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

- Surface soil and subsurface soil (to 3 feet below ground surface) will be excavated.

Former Southern Fire Training Area and Aircraft Parking Area (SWMUs 68 and 69)

- Surface soil will be excavated.

Soils at these sites are contaminated with metals

- After excavation, contaminated soil will be disposed of in a licensed off-site facility.

Sites at the Maritime Port - Mark Kimes

Tow Way Fuel Farm and Disposal Pits (SWMUs 7 and 8)

- Soils contaminated with polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAH) and arsenic will be removed by excavation.
- Free product will be removed from the groundwater by a skimming system.
- Contamination in the groundwater will be naturally attenuated, with periodic groundwater sampling and monitoring.
- After 2 years of remediation, an Engineering Evaluation Report will be developed.

TCE Plume near Tow Way Fuel Farm (SWMU 55)

- Conduct a pilot study injecting sodium permanganate into the groundwater to remediate the plume of TCE in groundwater.

Other Sites - Mark Kimes

Former Navy Exchange Repair/Maintenance Shop (SWMU 54)

- Conduct a pilot study injecting oxygen release compound into the groundwater to remediate the plume of benzene in groundwater.
- TCE contamination in the groundwater will be naturally attenuated and monitored through periodic groundwater sampling and monitoring.

Recent Sampling Event - Mark Kimes

Began on April 27 and ended on June 13, 2008.

9

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Fieldwork for 7 SWMUs followed the work plans approved by EPA.

Sites Included:

Corrective Measures Study:

- Hangar 200 Apron (SWMU 56)
- Former Bundy Area Maintenance Facilities (SWMU 61)
- Aircraft Parking Area (SWMU 69)
- Fuel Pipelines and Hydrant Pits (SWMU 74)

Phase I RCRA Facility Investigations:

- Former Bundy Disposal Area (SWMU 62)
- Quarry Disposal Site (SWMU 71)
- Pole Yard (SWMU 78)

Discussion:

- A member of the community voiced concern about the coconut palms in the Bundy area on base that are becoming yellow. He would like to know if some type of study can be made about this. DNER representative: This has been identified on Vieques and it is an infestation that is extending to several Caribbean islands. I will leave my telephone number and will look for more information.
- Jorge asked when the Governor signed the CDR for the Port.; David: I think it was approximately July 27, 2008.
- Lirio: What is happening with the Fideicomiso Plan? Neida Pumarejo said she is working with two other people on the Conservation Plan. The Fideicomiso requested an extension from the DNER to submit the Plan (until May 2009). She mentioned that they have come up against problems accessing the base with the Navy. For the past 11 months they have been in a building that does not have electricity and have had to move.
- A member of the expressed several concerns about the communication process with the public. She mentioned that the information provided by the LRA have not been adequate. She distrusts the agencies involved in the process; and stated that the area belong to the Ceibeños.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

V. ADJOURNMENT

The next RAB meeting is tentatively scheduled for November 13, 2008. The meeting was adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

VI. NEW AND ONGOING ACTION ITEMS FOR THE NEXT RAB MEETING

The following summarizes the new and ongoing action items that will be carried forward to the next RAB meeting on November 13, 2008.

Item	Description	Discussion	Status
#1	Drone activities that were conducted at Cabras Island.	Mr. Velázquez from base security will provide specific coordinates where the drones may be located.	Ongoing
#2	Information about excavation of historic artifacts on the base.	Navy will research who was involved in the fieldwork (particularly if they were archaeologists from Puerto Rico).	Ongoing
#3	Verify whether the LRA meeting was recorded and what the status of the meeting minutes is.		New
#4	Community member says that the Bundy area was not maintained and the buildings have been sabotaged and all of the asbestos and other toxic substances were left exposed, and people became sick.	Navy will investigate and verify whether there has been a study conducted at these buildings.	New

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

ATTACHMENT 1 - Meeting Attendees - September 9, 2008

RAB Community Members in Attendance	RAB Community Members Absent
Ramón D. Figueroa, Community Co-Chair	Samuel Caraballo
Ismael Velázquez	Carlos Brown
Luís A. Velázquez Rivera	Jimmy Concepción Robles
Jorge Fernández Porto	Ángel de Jesús Matta
Lirio Márquez D'Acunti	José Díaz
John Henry	Myrna Maldonado
Rafael Montes	Debra McWhirter
Agustín Velázquez Santos	Ramón M. Ríos
William Lourido	Daniel E. González
	Noraida Vázquez Arce
	Rogelio Figueroa

Community Members Visiting

Marilyn del Manzano	Ada Cruz
Marc Tallmadge	José de Jesús
Glorimar Toledo	Miguel Cruz Pimentel
Ramonita Luciano	Emérito Flores Nazario
José A. Rosa	Hector M. Díaz
Sonia Roldán	Maria E. Garcia
Abraham Morales Ortiz	Pedro J. Ortiz Pedraza
Danny Velazquez	Maria M. Huerta
	Hiram Rivera

RAB Agency Representatives in Attendance

David Criswell, Interim Navy Co-Chair	Navy, Deputy Base Closure Manager, Southeast
Antonio Colorado	Portal del Futuro (Local Reuse Authority [LRA])

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Tim Gordon	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2
Wilmarie Rivera	Puerto Rico Environmental Quality Board (EQB)
Neida Pumarejo Cintrón	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust
Vicente Quevedo	Puerto Rico Department of Natural and Environmental Resources (DNER)
Elizabeth Padilla	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust

Other Agency Representatives

Freddy de Jesús	Portal del Futuro (LRA)
José A. Candelaria	Portal del Futuro (LRA)
CDR Daniel Kalal	Naval Activity Puerto Rico

Support Staff Present

Susana Struve	CH2M HILL, Inc. (meeting facilitator, Navy contractor)
Pedro Ruiz	Naval Activity Puerto Rico
Mark Kimes	Baker Environmental, Inc. (Navy Installation Restoration Program contractor)

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

ATTACHMENT 2 - Meeting Presentations - September 9, 2008

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.